# Report to the District Development Management Committee



Report Reference: DEV-019-2016/17.

Date of meeting: 8 February 2017

Subject: Planning Application EPF/2573/16 - Woodings, Glovers Lane, Hastingwood, North Weald, Essex, CM17 9LA - Proposed demolition of the front porch and west side extension, both late 20th Century editions with replacement front porch and garden room with minor internal alterations. (Parallel listed building application under reference EPF/2583/16).

Responsible Officer: Sukhi Dhadwar (01992 564597)

Democratic Services: Gary Woodhall (01992 564470).

#### Recommendation:

(1) That planning permission be granted, subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2. The development hereby permitted will be completed strictly in accordance with the approved drawings nos: Heritage Statement dated 29/9/16, 1772/01, 02, 03, 04B, 05A, 06A, 07A.
- 3. Samples of the types and details of colours of all the external finishes shall be submitted for approval in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development, and the development shall be implemented in accordance with such approved detail.

## Report:

This application is before this Committee since it is an application that is submitted by or on behalf of Councillor Anne Grigg ((Pursuant to The Constitution, PartTwo, Article 10(f)

### **Description of Site:**

The application property comprises a Grade II listed cottage nestled within a generous verdant curtilage. There is approximately 14m deep outbuilding located close to the western boundary with Hazelwood in front of the application building.

The site is located in the furthermost eastern corner of Glovers Lane (a private road off Hastingwood Lane). To the south and east are open fields and to the north and west are generous residential plots containing large detached houses. The site fall within land designated as Green Belt.

#### **Description of Proposal:**

Permission is sought for the proposed demolition of the front porch and west side extension, both late 20<sup>th</sup> Century editions with replacement front porch and garden room with minor alterations.

The maximum dimensions of the proposed Garden Room are 5.1m wide by 7.6m deep and 3.73m high to the ridge of its gable roof.

The lean to porch measures 2.2m deep by 3.6m wide and 2.85m high to the ridge of its gable roof.

Materials include a red plain clay tiled roof and Slim-lite double glazing within an oak framed structure for the walls.

#### **Relevant History:**

Listed building consent was granted under reference LB/EPF/1316/97 for the demolition of existing bathroom and erection of single storey extension.

# **Policies Applied:**

National Planning Policy Framework National Planning Policy Guidance

Epping Forest District Local Plan (1998) and Alterations (2006).

CP2 – Protecting the quality of the rural and built environment GB2A – Development in the Green Belt DBE9 – Loss of amenity DBE10 – Residential extensions HC10- Works to a Listed Building

Epping Forest District Draft Local Plan: Consultation 2016

At the current time, only limited material weight can be applied to the Draft Local Plan, however the Draft Plan and evidence base should be considered as a material consideration in planning decisions. The relevant policies in this case are as follows:-

SP5 Green Belt and District Open Land DM7 Heritage Assets DM9 High Quality Design

#### **Consultation Carried out and Representations Received**

NORTH WEALD BASSETT PARISH COUNCIL raise no objection to the scheme.

5 neighbours were consulted which resulted in no objections and 1 letter of support being received.

FOUR GABLES: As a near neighbour of this property we regard this as a very welcome development and feel this is sympathetic to the character of the property.

#### **Main Issues and Considerations:**

The issues which are relevant to the determination of this application are:

- (a) Impact on the aims and purposes of the Green Belt
- (b) Impact on historic and architectural interest of the Grade II listed cottage and the visual amenity of the surrounding area; and
- (c) Impact on neighbouring residential amenity.

# Impact on the aims and purposes of the Green Belt

The National Planning Policy Framework states that the fundamental aim of the Green Belt is to prevent urban sprawl by keeping land permanently open; the essential characteristics of Green Belts are their openness and their permanence. There is a presumption against inappropriate development in the Green Belt and development should not be allowed except in very special circumstances.

Government guidance dictates that new development within the Green Belt is inappropriate unless it falls within the list of exceptions set out in paragraphs 89 and 90 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF), and provided it does not harm the openness of the Green Belt or conflict with any of the five purposes of including land within it.

Local Plan policies GB2A is broadly in compliance with the aims and objectives of national Green Belt policy. The NPPF states that one of the exceptions to inappropriate development within the Green Belt is the extension or alteration to a building provided that it does not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building. The Framework provides no guidance on how the "proportionality" of a proposal should be assessed. However previous Planning Inspectorate decisions indicate that a number of factors should be taken into account when determining whether an extension is disproportionate, these include height, volume, floorspace and design.

In this case, the existing extended floorspace together with the proposed new floorspace would equal around 47% of the original volume of the house. Furthermore the stepped in extension and lower eaves and ridge height of the 'Garden Room' results in this extension having a subordinate appearance in relation to the application property. The proposed porch extension also appears as an incidental feature in relation to the appearance of the main cottage. It is therefore considered that the proposal would be proportionate to the size of the original house and would therefore be appropriate development within the Green Belt in accordance with paragraph 89 of the NPPF.

# Impact on the openness of the Green Belt

The extension is not inappropriate development and appears as a backdrop to the existing house. The proposal will therefore have a neutral impact on the character and openness of the site. The proposal therefore accords with the requirements of Chapter 9 of the NPPF and policy GB2A of the Local Plan.

Impact of the proposal on the historic and architectural interest of the Grade II building

S66(1) of the Planning and Listed Building and Conservation Areas Act 1990 makes it clear that a Local Planning Authority (LPA) should have special regard to the desirability of preserving the Listed Building and its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which is possess.

Paragraph 133 requires that where a proposed development will lead to substantial harm to or total loss of significance of a designated heritage, local planning authorities should refuse consent, unless it can be demonstrated that the substantial harm or loss is necessary to achieve substantial public benefit sufficient to outweigh this loss.

Paragraph 134 of the NPPF requires that "Where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal, including securing its optimum viable use."

The proposal was reviewed by the Conservation Officer who made the following comments:-

The Woodings is a grade II listed early 17<sup>th</sup> century cottage. It has been extended several times during the 20<sup>th</sup> century with a single-storey cat-slide extension to the front and two single storey extensions to each end (the most recent dating from 1997). The application seeks consent for the removal of the single storey extension to the south west (most likely dating from the 1980s) and the erection of a garden room style extension in its place, and the erection of a front porch extension.

The removal of the 1980s extension raises no objections; it is a poorly detailed extension to the building, particularly with its faux pitched roof terminating in a flat roof. It is, however, proposed to retain about a metre of this extension to act as a link to join the historic cottage with the new garden room. This is considered to be acceptable as it offers a clear distinction between the building phases and provides an articulated link between the two buildings. Additionally, it ensures that no historic fabric is impacted by the works. The proposed garden room extension is sensitively designed to respect the character of the host dwelling. It is traditional in form with a pitched roof, brick plinth, and timber framed windows, reading well as a stand-alone addition thanks to the link element.

The proposed front porch extension is a more prominent addition to the building given its location and projection from the cat-slide element. On balance, however, it is considered acceptable as it does not cause undue harm to the special interest of the building. The original cottage can still be read as the porch extension is clearly distinguishable as a later addition. It will also allow for better use of the internal space and, given the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century date of the cat-slide roof, will not result in the loss of any significant historic fabric.

It was noted on site that the roof of the cat-slide extension is substandard in construction. It is likely that this roof will have to be upgraded as part of the works. A suggestion was made regarding the potential of re-tiling of the roof in slate (which performs better than plain tile at a slacker pitch) which may be pursued by the owner. This could be covered by a condition but it may be beneficial to amend the drawings to include an annotation to this effect.

It is recommended that listed building consent is granted subject to the following conditions:

- Samples of the types and details of colours of all the external finishes shall be submitted to and approved by the LPA in writing prior to the commencement of any works.
- Additional drawings that show details of proposed new windows, doors, eaves and verges, by section and elevation at scales between 1:20 and 1:1 as appropriate, shall be submitted to and approved by the LPA in writing prior to the commencement of any works.
- All rainwater goods shall be of black painted aluminium."

It is on this basis considered that the development complies with the requirements chapter 12 of the NPPF and HC10 of our Local Plan and Alterations (1998 and 2006).

Impact on the living conditions of neighbouring residential properties

Hazelwood is positioned over 15m north - west of the application property and therefore will not be significantly affected in terms of light, outlook, dominance or privacy.

All other residential properties are sufficiently distant as to not be materially affected. The proposal therefore accords with the requirements of policy DBE 9 of the Local Plan.

# Conclusion

The proposal subject to conditions is appropriate development within the Green Belt and will have a neutral impact on its character and openness. The proposal will also preserve the special architectural and historical interest of the Grade II dwelling house. The proposal will also not unduly harm neighbouring residential amenity. It is therefore considered to be sustainable development which accords with national and local policy.